

## OJ 5/7a, [40] (formerly vC 40) - Handwritten letter from Schenker to Cube, undated [c. October 29, 1931]

[[http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-5-7a\\_40.html](http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-5-7a_40.html)]

Mein Lieber Prof v. Cube [Felix-Eberhard von Cube]<sup>1</sup>

Frl. *Elias* [Angi Elias]<sup>2</sup> hat über meine Aufforderung für Sie eine Reinschrift der Arbeit gemacht, die ich mit ihr in den Stunden fertiggestellt habe[corr].<sup>3</sup> Dieses Stadium ist fast druckfertig, dennoch werde ich die Tafel bei Gelegenheit der Durcharbeitung auch in meinem kleinen Seminar<sup>4</sup> vielleicht noch „gustiren“ u. dies u. jenes (vielleicht!) noch veredeln, verdeutlichen, sodaß das Bild **auch** ohne Text „reden“ kann.<sup>5</sup> Das Blatt des Frl. *El.* [Angi Elias] dürfen Sie ohne Weiteres {2} schon in den Dienst Ihres Unterrichtes stellen!

Nun eine Bitte: machen Sie ein Schönbild des Blattes, das mir zur Vorlage im Seminar dienen könnte. Vielleicht bleibt Ihre Vorlage die letzte u. geht in Stich oder zum Photographen oder ..

Zuletzt erhält Prof *Violin* [Moriz Violin] die Vorlage (nebst 10/12 [Etude in C minor, Op. 10, No. 12] von *Chop.* [Frederic Chopin])<sup>6</sup> u. wir beginnen die Beratung über die Form der Veröffentlichung u. Verwertung.

An Frl. *Elias* [Angi Elias] bitte ich ein Paar Zeilen des Dankes zu richten [address cued from the bottom margin:] Frl. Angi Elias, Wien [I] I, Gölsdorfstr. 4. Vielleicht hat sie Gelegenheit, noch weitere Dienste mit ihren in den Stunden (allerdings nicht ganz druckfertigen) erreichten Vorlagen zu leisten.

{3} Achten Sie genauer auf die Bogen!

Fis des Basses in T. **22** ist nur wegen es<sup>1</sup> der Oberst, da (besser an sich: fis<sup>#7</sup> als #f#7); ist es<sup>1</sup> zu d<sup>1</sup> fortgegangen, so ist

My dear Professor von Cube [Felix-Eberhard von Cube],<sup>1</sup>

At my request, Miss Elias [Angi Elias]<sup>2</sup> has made a fair copy of the work,<sup>3</sup> which I completed with her during her lessons. This version is nearly ready for publication; nevertheless I will use the opportunity of revision perhaps still to "savor" the graph in my little seminar group,<sup>4</sup> and to further ennoble and clarify matters here and there (possibly!), so that the picture can "speak" **even** without text.<sup>5</sup> You may now, without further ado, place Fräulein Elias [Angi Elias]'s work {2} in the service of your teaching!

Now, I have a favor to ask of you. Make a fair copy of this page, which I can use as a model in my seminar. Perhaps your model will remain the final version and will be printed or photo-reproduced, or ...

In the end, Professor Violin [Moriz Violin] will receive the model (along with Chopin [Frederic Chopin]'s Op.10, No. 12 [Etude in C minor, Op. 10, No. 12]),<sup>6</sup> and we shall begin consultation about the form of the publication and how it will be used.

Please send a few words of thanks to Miss Elias [Angi Elias] [address cued from the bottom margin:] Miss Angi Elias, Wien I, Gölsdorfstrasse 4. Perhaps she will have the occasion to render yet other services, with the models that she has prepared in her lessons, even if these are not entirely ready for publication.

{3} Pay closer attention to the slurs!

F# appears in the bass in bar **22** only because of e#<sup>1</sup> in the upper voice (as support for the flattened seventh: f# is

wieder f notwendig geworden, wenn [slur to] 7 folgen soll. Gemäß dem Gesetz: „man habe den Griff schon in der Hand“ (*Em. Bach* [Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach])<sup>7</sup> gehört denn f in die l. H. Daher ist fis des Basses u. f der Mittelst. kein Querstand: je eigener Grund waltet dort u. hier, die Folge stellt keinen Zusammenhang beider Töne vor. Endlich: die Sekund d<sup>1</sup>–c<sup>1</sup> im 6/5 über A# läßt als Sekund eine Auskomponierung in der früheren Art nicht zu! Daher u. nur deshalb fingiert *Bach* [Johann Sebastian Bach] dem Terzraum h–d<sup>1</sup>, um etwas ähnliches zu bringen. (Kommt oft bei ihm u. Anderen vor)<sup>8</sup> {4} Den Rest entnehmen Sie leicht dem Bild u. den Korrekturen Ihres Blattes.

Von Prof *Violin* [Moriz Violin] werden Sie den Inhalt des Briefes von *Weisse* [Hans Weisse] erfahren. Er ist schon wirklich erhehend.<sup>9</sup> Der Einfachheit halber lege ich alle Briefe u. Beilagen zusammen.

Mit besten Grüßen von uns Beiden  
Ihr  
[ signed: ] *H Schenker* [Heinrich Schenker]

better per se than f#). As soon as e#<sup>1</sup> has proceeded to d<sup>1</sup>, the f has once again become important if [slur to] 7 is to follow. In accordance with C. P. E. Bach [Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach]'s principle, that "the keys should already be lying beneath the hand,"<sup>7</sup> f belongs in the left hand. For this reason, f# in the bass versus f in the middle voice does not signify a cross relation: each note has its own reason for being there; the succession does not represent any connection between the two notes. Finally: the second d<sup>1</sup>–c<sup>1</sup> in the 6/5 above A#, being a second, does not permit an elaboration of the sort that occurred earlier. For this reason, and only this reason, Bach [Johann Sebastian Bach] pretends that there is the space of a third between b and d<sup>1</sup>, to produce something similar. (This happens frequently in the music of Bach [Johann Sebastian Bach], and others.)<sup>8</sup> {4} The rest you will understand easily from the graph and from the corrections to your work.

You will learn from Professor Violin [Moriz Violin] the content of Weisse [Hans Weisse]'s letter. It is indeed most encouraging.<sup>9</sup> For sake of simplicity I am putting all letters and additional material together.

With best wishes from the two of us,  
Yours,  
[ signed: ] H. Schenker [Heinrich Schenker]

## Citation

Schenker Documents Online, OJ 5/7a, [40] (formerly vC 40), transcr. and transl.  
William Drabkin  
[http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-5-7a\\_40.html](http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-5-7a_40.html)  
Accessed: 05 October 2024

## Footnotes

<sup>1</sup> Writing of this letter is recorded in Schenker's diary at OJ 4/5, p. 3673, October 29, 1931: "An Floriz (Br. u. ein Brief an v. Cube als Beilage): sende Weisses Brief; für Cube eine Korrektur u. Elias-Vorlage: das Ganze noch zurückgehalten." ("To Floriz (letter and a letter to von Cube as enclosure): I send Weisse's letter; for Cube a correction and Elias's copy: the whole thing still retained."). There is no further reference to its being dispatched. This entry is the source of the approximate date proposed here for this document.

<sup>2</sup> Schenker's lesson notes for 1931/32 (OJ 16/9) contain the following entry for Elias on October 27, 1931: "Fingers. 129 u Vortrag forts.; bringt Präl. I (für Cube) 2 auch für C u. für mich." ("Fingering for Op. 129 and performance continued; brings Prelude No. 1 (for Cube) 2 for C[ube] and for me.").

<sup>3</sup> The Prelude in C major [Prelude in C major, Well-Tempered Clavier, Book I] from the *Well-Tempered Clavier*, Book 1. The

present letter is a response to Cube's letter of October 20, 1931 (OJ 9/34, [29]

[[http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-9-34\\_29.html](http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-9-34_29.html)]), and the graph of the Bach prelude that he had recently prepared, not the graph of the same prelude sent to Schenker on January 2, 1930 (OJ 9/34, [20]

[[http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-9-34\\_20.html](http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-9-34_20.html)]). For an earlier transcription and translation, and facsimile reproduction, see William Drabkin, "A Lesson in Analysis from Heinrich Schenker: the C Major Prelude from Bach's Well-Tempered Clavier, Book I," *Music Analysis*, 4 (1985), pp. 241–58 (where the letter was misdated).

<sup>4</sup> The weekly seminar in analysis (comprising Felix Salzer and three students of Hans Weisse (who had left for New York), Trude Kral, Greta Kraus, and Manfred Willfort) in Schenker's apartment, which ran for three seasons (1931–4), is described briefly in Salzer's forward to the reprint of the *Fünf Urfinie-Tafeln* as *Five Graphic Music Analyses* (New York: Dover, 1969), see pp. 17–21.

<sup>5</sup> In his letter of October 16, 1931 (OJ 9/34, [28] [[http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-9-34\\_28.html](http://www.schenkerdocumentsonline.org/documents/correspondence/OJ-9-34_28.html)]), Cube had indicated that a "written elucidation" would accompany his graphic analysis of the prelude. The concept of *Urfinie-Tafel*, in which such commentary is no longer required, is enshrined in the phrase "the picture can speak even without a text."

<sup>6</sup> The Etude in C minor, Op. 10, No. 12, often known as the "Revolutionary Etude," is the last work graphed in the *Fünf Urfinie-Tafeln*.

<sup>7</sup> C. P. E. Bach *Versuch über die wahre Art das Clavier zu spielen* (Berlin: author, 1753–62). Schenker owned a copy of the Gustav Schilling edition (Berlin: Fr. Stage, 1856) (*Musik und Theater, Enthaltend die Bibliothek des Herrn Dr. Heinrich Schenker, Wien* (Vienna: Antiquariat Heinrich Hinterberger, n.d.)).

<sup>8</sup> Schenker is probably thinking of Bach's Violin Concerto in E, first movement, mm. 23–24, where the interval of a third in the bass is similarly filled in by passing note and the diminution has a "life of its own"; see *Das Meisterwerk in der Musik*, vol. 1 (1925), p. 120 (Eng. trans., p. 64), Fig. 2. The example is repeated in *Der freie Satz* (Fig. 119/16a).

<sup>9</sup> By this time, Hans Weisse had arrived in New York to teach at the David Mannes School of Music.